

Daf 27a

and they each said: Take them up to the *sukka*.

ואמרו העלום לסוכה

Comment/Chiddush

Can we really learn from what these great men did that this would not be presumptive on our part?

And when they gave Rabbi Tzadok less than an egg-bulk of food, he took the food in a cloth and he ate it outside the *sukka* and did not recite a blessing after eating it. The Gemara infers: Had they given him an egg-bulk of food, he would have been required to eat it in a *sukka*. Let us say that this is a conclusive refutation of the opinion of Rav Yosef and Abaye, who said that one is permitted to eat that measure in the context of a casual meal outside the *sukka*. The Gemara answers: No proof can be cited from here, because perhaps the reason the mishna emphasizes that Rabbi Tzadok ate less than an egg-bulk of food is that eating less than an egg-bulk does not require washing hands and reciting a blessing after eating it; however, eating an egg-bulk requires washing and reciting a blessing.

וכשנתנו לו לרבי צדוק אוכל פחות מכביצה נטלו במפה ואכלו חוץ לסוכה ולא בירך אחריו הא כביצה בעי סוכה לימא תיהוי תיובתיה דרב יוסף ואביי דילמא פחות מכביצה נטילה וברכה לא בעי הא כביצה בעי נטילה וברכה:

Comment/Chiddush

Why wasn't he stringent? 1. He wanted to teach others that someone who is not stringent is still ok. 2. And in addition he was afraid that had he insisted on eating in the *sukka* others may infer that it needs to be eaten in the *sukka* and recite the blessing on the *sukka* when eating such foods, leading to a blessing recited in vain. 3. Or he felt it was presumptive on his part.

MISHNA: Rabbi Eliezer says: A person is obligated to eat fourteen meals in the *sukka* over the course of the seven days of the festival of *Sukkot*, one during the day each day and one at night each night. And the Rabbis say: There is no quota for the number of meals, and one may choose whether or not to eat any of the meals except for the meal on the evening of the first Festival day of *Sukkot*, which one is required to eat in the *sukka*.

מתני' רבי אליעזר אומר ארבע עשרה סעודות חייב אדם לאכול בסוכה אחת ביום ואחת בלילה וחכ"א אין לדבר קצבה חוץ מלילי יו"ט ראשון של חג בלבד

Comment/Chiddush

Aren't there three meals on Shabbos, bringing the total to fifteen? Some say that since the third meal on Shabbos is close to nightfall, one would not need to eat another full meal after Shabbos. Or that the third meal on Shabbos is fulfilled with an olive-sized piece of bread, which does not need the *sukka*. And some say that indeed, its fifteen meals

And furthermore, Rabbi Eliezer said: One who did not eat a meal on the evening of the first day of the Festival should compensate with a meal on the evening of the last day of the Festival, on the Eighth Day of Assembly, despite the fact that he will not eat it in the *sukka*. And the Rabbis say: There is no compensation for this matter, and with regard to similar cases where it is impossible to rectify failure to fulfill a positive mitzva, it is stated: "That which is crooked cannot be made straight; and that which is wanting cannot be numbered" ([Ecclesiastes 1:15](#)).

ועוד אמר ר' אליעזר מי שלא אכל [לילי] יום טוב הראשון של ישלים לילי יו"ט האחרון של חג וחכמים אומרים אין לדבר תשלומין ועל זה נאמר (קהלת א, טו) מעות לא יוכל לתקון וחסרון לא יוכל להמנות:

Comment/Chiddush

Only the last night? Not the day too?

GEMARA: The Gemara asks: What is the rationale for the opinion of Rabbi Eliezer, who mandates eating fourteen meals in the *sukka*? The Gemara answers that he derives his opinion from the verse: "In *sukkot* shall you reside" ([Leviticus 23:42](#)), which the Sages interpreted to

גמי' מ"ט דר' אליעזר תשבו כעין תדורו מה דירה אחת ביום

Daf 27a

mean: Reside **as you dwell** in your permanent home. Therefore, **just as** in one's **dwelling** one typically eats **one meal during the day and one meal at night, so too, in a sukka** one eats **one meal during the day and one meal at night.**

ואחת בלילה אף
סוכה אחת ביום
ואחת בלילה

The Gemara asks: **And** how do **the Rabbis** interpret that verse? The Gemara answers: They explain that a *sukka* is like a permanent **dwelling**. **Just as** in one's **dwelling, if one desires** to eat, **he eats, and if one does not desire** to do so, **he does not eat, so too, in the sukka, if one desires** to eat, **he eats, and if one does not desire** to do so, **he does not eat.**

ורבנן כדירה מה דירה אי
בעי אכיל אי בעי לא אכיל
אף סוכה נמי אי בעי
אכיל אי בעי לא אכיל

Comment/Chiddush

Rashi: One may fast on Sukkos. Others take issue with this.

The Gemara asks: **If so**, then according to the Rabbis, **even on the first Festival evening as well** one should not be required to eat in the *sukka*.

אי הכי אפי' לילי
יום טוב ראשון נמי

Rabbi Yohanan said in the name of Rabbi Shimon ben Yehotzadak: There is a verbal analogy between the festivals of Passover and *Sukkot*. **It is stated here**, with regard to *Sukkot*: "On the **fifteenth** day of this seventh month is the festival of *Sukkot* for seven days unto the Lord" ([Leviticus 23:34](#)). **And it is stated:** "And on the **fifteenth** day of the same month is the festival of *matzot* unto the Lord" ([Leviticus 23:6](#)) **with regard to** the festival of **Passover**. **Just as there**, with regard to Passover, on **the first night** there is **an obligation** to eat *matza* and **from that point onward it is optional**, as from that point onward the only obligation is to refrain from eating leaven, **so too here**, with regard to *Sukkot*, on **the first night** there is **an obligation** to eat in the *sukka* and **from that point onward it is optional.**

א"ר יוחנן משום ר'
שמעון בן יהוצדק נאמר
כאן חמשה עשר ונאמ'
חמשה עשר בחג
המצות מה להלן לילה
הראשון חובה מכאן
ואילך רשות אף כאן
לילה הראשון חובה
מכאן ואילך רשות

Comment/Chiddush

There are many halachos learned from the juxtaposition of Pesach and Sukkos – that one must eat an olive-sized piece in the sukka and that one should not eat on Sukkos eve so that one eats with gusto etc.

The Gemara asks: **And there**, with regard to Passover, **from where do we** derive that there is an obligation to eat *matza* on the first night? The Gemara answers that **the verse says:** "**In the evening you shall eat *matzot***" ([Exodus 12:18](#)). **The verse established it as an obligation.**

והתם מנלן אמר קרא
(שמות יב, יח) בערב
תאכלו מצות הכתוב קבעו
חובה:

§ The mishna continues: **And furthermore, Rabbi Eliezer said** that one who did not eat a meal on the evening of the first day of the Festival should compensate with a meal on the evening of the last day of the Festival. The Gemara asks: **But didn't Rabbi Eliezer say that a person is obligated to eat fourteen meals in the sukka, one during the day and one at night?** However, the

ועוד א"ר אליעזר:
והא א"ר אליעזר
ארבע עשרה
סעודות חייב אדם
לאכול בסוכה

Daf 27a

compensatory meal on the evening of the Eighth Day of Assembly is not eaten in the *sukka*. **Beira said that Rabbi Ami said: Rabbi Eliezer retracted** his previous statement and agrees with the Rabbis that there is no quota for the meals that one must eat in the *sukka*, and it is only the meal on the first evening of the Festival that one must eat in the *sukka*. Their dispute is with regard to compensation if one failed to eat the meal on the first evening.

אחת ביום ואחת
בלילה אמר בירא
א"ר אמי חזר בו
ר' אליעזר

Comment/Chiddush

How is the question answered? The Maharshal explains that the eating of fourteen meals is an expression of living in the *sukka*, that cannot be made up outside the *sukka*. But eating the first night is not necessarily *sukka*-related, at least according to Rabbi Eliezer, and therefore can be made up on the last day too.

The Gemara asks: **With what will he compensate** for his failure to eat the Festival meal? **If we say** that he compensates **with bread, he is** thereby **eating the festive meal of that Eighth Day** of Assembly; how is it obvious that it is compensation for a different meal? **Rather, what is** the meaning of: **He should compensate?** It means that **he should compensate by** adding **types of delicacies [*targima*]**. **That is taught in a *baraita* as well: If he compensated by** adding **types of delicacies, he fulfilled his obligation.**

משלים במאי אילימא
בריפתא סעודה
דיומיה קא אכיל אלא
מאי ישלים ישלים
במיני תרגימא תניא
נמי הכי אם השלים
במיני תרגימא יצא

Comment/Chiddush

Although the first night one must eat an olive-sized piece of bread, specifically bread, one can make it up with delicacies instead, because its only make-up, and less than the original.

The steward [*apotropos*] of King Agrippas asked Rabbi Eliezer: Forsomeone like me, who is accustomed to eat only one meal a day, what is the *halakha*? Is it sufficient that I eat one meal and exempt myself from the obligation to eat any more that day? Rabbi Eliezer **said to him: Each day you continue eating and taste various kinds of appetizers in deference to your own desires, and now you do not continue eating even one appetizer in deference to your Maker?**

שאל אפוטרופוס של אגריפס המלך את
רבי אליעזר כגון אני שאיני רגיל לאכול
אלא סעודה אחת ביום מהו שאוכל סעודה
אחת ואפטר אמר לו בכל יום ויום אתה
ממשיך כמה פרפראות לכבוד עצמך
ועכשיו אי אתה ממשיך פרפרת אחת
לכבוד קונך

Comment/Chiddush

The steward's question was that if you consider the *sukka* living to be like one lives at his normal routine, then my routine is to eat only one meal a day. To which he was answered that the truth is he eats many meals a day.

And the steward further asked Rabbi Eliezer: **For someone like me, who has two wives, one in Tiberias and one in Tzippori, and has two *sukkot*, one in Tiberias and one in Tzippori, what is the *halakha*?** Can I depart from one *sukka* to another *sukka* and exempt myself from the obligation? In other words, is it permitted to fulfill the mitzva in one *sukka* for part of *Sukkot* and in another for the rest of the Festival? Rabbi Eliezer **said to him: No, as I say that anyone who departs from one *sukka* to another *sukka* has negated the mitzva of the first.** The obligation is to reside in the same *sukka* for all seven days.

ועוד שאלו כגון אני שיש לי שתי
נשים אחת בטבריא ואחת
בציפורי ויש לי שתי סוכות אחת
בטבריא ואחת בציפורי מהו
שאצא מסוכה לסוכה ואפטר
אמר לו לא שאני אומר כל היוצא
מסוכה לסוכה בטל מצותה של
ראשונה

Comment/Chiddush

Daf 27a

This flows from the last question – granted that I indeed snack a lot during the day, but what about my living; I live the whole year half here and half there. Is that Ok, because its my personal norm? To which the answer was given that two sukkas can never work, even if they are no problem with being at odds with his normal living. Aruch Laner

It is taught in a *baraita* that **Rabbi Eliezer** says:

תניא ר' אליעזר אומר

Comment/Chiddush